

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO  
WESTERN DIVISION

\* \* \*

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, : Case No. 1:20-cr-00142-1  
:  
Plaintiff, : **Jury Trial, Day 6**  
: Tuesday, June 28, 2022  
- v - :  
: 9:00 a.m.  
ALEXANDER SITTENFELD, a/k/a :  
"P.G. Sittenfeld," :  
:  
Defendant. : Cincinnati, Ohio

\* \* \*

**EXCERPTED PROCEEDINGS - TESTIMONY OF JAIME KINCAID**

BEFORE THE HONORABLE DOUGLAS R. COLE, DISTRICT JUDGE

\* \* \*

For the Plaintiff: EMILY N. GLATFELTER, ESQ.  
MATTHEW C. SINGER, ESQ.  
MEGAN GAFFNEY PAINTER, ESQ.  
U.S. Department of Justice  
U.S. Attorney's Office  
221 E. Fourth Street, Suite 400  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

For the Defendant: CHARLES M. RITTGERS, ESQ.  
CHARLES H. RITTGERS, ESQ.  
NEAL D. SCHUETT, ESQ.  
Rittgers & Rittgers  
12 E. Warren Street  
Lebanon, Ohio 45036

Law Clerk: Jacob T. Denz, Esq.

Courtroom Deputy: Scott M. Lang

Court Reporter: M. Sue Lopreato, RMR, CRR  
513.564.7679

\* \* \*

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 (In open court at 3:09 p.m.)

3 \* \* \*

4 THE COURT: Is the government prepared to call  
5 another witness?

6 MR. SINGER: Yes, Your Honor. The government calls  
7 Jaime Kincaid.

8 THE COURT: Very good.

9 (Government witness, JAIME KINCAID, sworn.)

10 MR. SINGER: Your Honor, may I approach to begin the  
11 examination?

12 THE COURT: You may.

13 MR. SINGER: Thank you.

14 DIRECT EXAMINATION

15 BY MR. SINGER:

16 Q. Good afternoon.

17 A. Good afternoon.

18 Q. Can you state and spell your name for the record, please.

19 A. Yeah. My name is Jay Kincaid, J-a-y, K-i-n-c-a-i-d.

20 Q. Mr. Kincaid, where do you work?

21 A. I work at a real estate company called Kilcarnie  
22 Properties.

23 Q. And how long have you been doing that?

24 A. Since January of 2021.

25 Q. What did you do prior to working in real estate?

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 A. Prior to that, I worked in politics for about a decade.  
2 I had various positions. I was a fundraiser chief of staff to  
3 Mayor Cranley, and then worked as a lobbyist.

4 Q. And what kind of work did you do as a lobbyist?

5 A. So I represented, I would say mostly real estate  
6 developers.

7 Q. And what does a lobbyist do?

8 A. So from my perspective, you know, first and foremost, it  
9 was consulting with them to talk about, sort of, paths forward  
10 to help them achieve their business goals.

11 And then second to that, once, sort of, a path was  
12 settled on, if there were times where we had to interact with  
13 government officials or government employees, I would often do  
14 that.

15 Q. When did you start working as a lobbyist?

16 A. I began working as a lobbyist in June of 2017.

17 Q. Now you mentioned work that you did for real estate  
18 developers. Did you provide consulting at all to public  
19 officials?

20 A. In a paid capacity?

21 Q. In either capacity.

22 A. Yeah. So while I was working as a lobbyist, I continued  
23 to have relationships with elected officials who would, at  
24 times, call me and ask for advice.

25 Q. Do you know an individual named Alexander P.G.

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 Sittenfeld?

2 A. I do.

3 Q. How do you know him?

4 A. I met P.G. in late 2010, as he was first considering a  
5 run for city council. I was introduced to him as he was  
6 making his rounds to meet with folks and talk about a  
7 potential run.

8 At that time, I was just starting to consult on my own,  
9 and he hired me at that time. I believe he was maybe my first  
10 or second client ever.

11 Q. Can you just sort of describe the nature of your  
12 relationship with Sittenfeld?

13 A. Yeah. So in 2011, I worked for him. Around the same  
14 time I met P.G., I also met my wife, whose family happened to  
15 be close with the Sittenfelds. So, you know, my  
16 brother-in-law, lifelong friend with P.G. My wife was friends  
17 with P.G.'s sister, who was the wedding photographer for us.

18 And after I stopped working for him, continued to have a  
19 relationship with him, a friendship. I still consider P.G. a  
20 friend.

21 Q. Do you know an individual named Chinedum Ndukwe?

22 A. I do.

23 Q. And how do you know him?

24 A. I met Chinedum -- I think the first time I ever met him  
25 was election night in 2013. John Cranley had just been

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 elected mayor, and there was a victory party that Chinedum was  
2 at. He was one of the last people at the party, and I was  
3 introduced to him and met him that night.

4 Stayed in contact with him after Mayor Cranley took  
5 office, and I was serving as the chief of staff through  
6 sometime in 2014. I don't recall exactly when.

7 And then there was a point in 2014 where Mayor Cranley  
8 and Chinedum had a -- I would say a falling out over some  
9 things that Chinedum -- over a disagreement of what John could  
10 potentially do on behalf of Chinedum.

11 And so from that point on, that relationship had ended.  
12 And because I was working for the mayor, I had no further  
13 contact with Chinedum until 2017, when I started working as a  
14 lobbyist. He reached out to me and asked for help getting a  
15 letter from the city about potentially working with him to  
16 redevelop 435 Elm Street.

17 Q. So when did you say you started working for Mr. Ndukwe?

18 A. So in June of 2017, he reached out to me. He engaged me  
19 very briefly to help try to get this letter. I don't think he  
20 ever got it. It was a very brief engagement.

21 And then I had no contact with him again until March of  
22 2018. A mutual friend of ours reached out and said, hey,  
23 would you consider taking Chinedum on as a client. I think he  
24 could use the help. And that's when Chinedum hired me. I  
25 worked for him from March of 2018 through April of 2019.

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 Q. Were there specific projects that you helped Mr. Ndukwe  
2 on?

3 A. Yeah. I helped on 435 Elm Street. I helped him on his  
4 hotel project in Mt. Auburn. Those were specific ones. And  
5 then beyond that, he -- you know he was looking at various  
6 deals, and so I gave advice and helped on those.

7 But the two that I did any amount of true lobbying on his  
8 behalf were 435 Elm Street and his Mt. Auburn hotel.

9 Q. I think you said you stopped working for him in April  
10 2019. Why did you stop working for him at that time?

11 A. So at the beginning of April is when the City of  
12 Cincinnati and the Port Authority began -- entered into  
13 discussions for the sale of 435 Elm Street from the city to  
14 the Port Authority.

15 At that time, the Port Authority was also a client of  
16 mine. And the CEO, Laura Brunner, came to me and said, hey,  
17 because you have Chin as a client and you have us as a client,  
18 and we are likely going to buy this, we're going to wall you  
19 off from 435 Elm. We're not going to talk to you about that.

20 And then several weeks later, she came back to me and  
21 said, hey, we've discussed it. It's highly likely that we're  
22 going to buy this. And because at the time that we buy it, we  
23 will be adverse to Chinedum, we're going to ask you to choose,  
24 either you stick with us as a client or stick with him as a  
25 client, but you can't have both. And so at that time, I ended

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 my relationship with Chinedum.

2 Q. So during the period where you were working on Ndukwe's  
3 behalf for purposes of 435, what type of work were you doing?

4 A. So it was a combination of what I stated earlier, just  
5 about my lobbying work in general. It was giving him advice  
6 on how to proceed, options on how he could proceed, whether  
7 it's, you know, trying to get council to push for this, trying  
8 to get career employees to push for it, how to approach the  
9 mayor.

10 And then beyond that, it was representing him in meetings  
11 with career employees, talking to elected officials on his  
12 behalf, and just generally helping him navigate the process.

13 Q. Can you describe any issues you were having advancing the  
14 435 Elm Street project in the city?

15 A. Well, I think that the challenge for Chin was that he had  
16 never done a project this big. And both career city employees  
17 and elected officials had concerns about his ability to pull  
18 it off, and so, you know, that was a big hurdle to try to  
19 overcome.

20 Q. Are you familiar with individuals named Rob Miller and  
21 Brian Bennett?

22 A. I am.

23 Q. How do you know them?

24 A. So Chinedum introduced me to them over drinks at the 21c.  
25 I don't recall when that was. But he introduced me to them as

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 his out-of-town partners.

2 Q. Did you have any other personal interactions with them?

3 A. So I met them the first time, had no personal interaction  
4 with them for an extended period of time.

5 And then in April of 2019, I believe I had a lunch with  
6 them that came about because I had -- in giving Chinedum  
7 advice, I told him, hey, I think these guys' behavior is  
8 hurting your chances of getting a deal, and you need to have a  
9 conversation with them. So that was the meeting.

10 Q. So what were your impressions of Rob Miller and Brian  
11 Bennett after meeting them in person?

12 A. My impressions of Brian and Rob were that they were  
13 incredibly peculiar for developers, in both their behavior and  
14 their appearance, quite frankly.

15 They -- my experience in dealing with developers is that  
16 they -- most developers -- no developer I'd ever worked with  
17 had ever bragged to me about how much money they had, how much  
18 money they made, what their bank account looked like. And Rob  
19 and Brian were doing that in an offputting way.

20 On top of it, they didn't look like any developer I'd  
21 ever seen. Most developers look like schlubs. You know, they  
22 show up to meetings in jeans and a T-shirt, you know, looking  
23 like they just finished cutting their grass.

24 Rob and Brian were, I would say, well put together. You  
25 know, Rob had a perfectly groomed 5:00 shadow, was wearing,



KINCAID - DIRECT

1     you know, more gold jewelry than I'd ever seen any man wear,  
2     with maybe the exception of Mr. T. They just didn't look the  
3     part, and they didn't feel -- something felt off about them is  
4     what I'm saying.

5     Q. Do you recall any conversations you had with Sittenfeld  
6     about Rob Miller and Brian Bennett?

7     A. I do. So after P.G. first met with them, he called me  
8     and we had a conversation about the meeting.

9             And what P.G. related to me was that Rob and Brian showed  
10     up with \$10,000 in cash, and -- but he had turned that down.  
11     And then we had a conversation in which he said that, you  
12     know, they were so over the top, do you think they might be  
13     FBI agents.

14     Q. Do you recall when that conversation occurred?

15     A. I don't recall the exact timing of the conversation. It  
16     was, I think, sometime early in my time working for Chinedum,  
17     so early to mid 2018.

18     Q. Certainly prior to April 2019?

19     A. Correct.

20     Q. Do you recall any other conversations you had with  
21     Sittenfeld about Rob Miller and Brian Bennett?

22     A. I do. I had conversations multiple times where I advised  
23     him not to take any contributions from them.

24     Q. And what was his response?

25     A. You know, he listened, but I had the sense that he was

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 not going to take my advice.

2 Q. Did you tell Sittenfeld why you thought he should steer  
3 clear of Rob Miller and Brian Bennett?

4 A. I did. You know, at the time of these conversations, I  
5 had heard several concerning stories about Rob and Brian's  
6 behavior. The first was them showing up with \$10,000 in cash  
7 to a meeting with P.G.

8 Second, I had been told by Jared Kamrass, who was raising  
9 money for Mayor Cranley, that Brian and Rob had told him that  
10 they were going to give, but they would need the mayor's  
11 assurances that he would help them on 435 Elm Street. And I'd  
12 heard about a trip that Brian and Rob had taken another  
13 councilmember on.

14 All three of those things were, I would say, in my  
15 experience, highly unusual for a developer to do, or anyone to  
16 do in a political setting.

17 And I felt like, taking all three of them together, it  
18 was a huge flashing red stop sign that said there was just  
19 something not right going on with these guys.

20 My advice to P.G. was not -- it wasn't criminal advice,  
21 it was political advice. I didn't think that he was doing  
22 anything wrong. I thought Brian and Rob were doing something  
23 wrong, and that it was likely that they would be -- there was  
24 a good chance that they would get in trouble.

25 And from a political standpoint, it seemed to me that it

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 was not worth the risk of having taken some amount of money  
2 from them and being left holding the bag when they got in  
3 trouble.

4 Q. And was this one conversation or was this multiple  
5 conversations?

6 A. I had that conversation multiple times with P.G.

7 Q. And do you recall when you had these conversations?

8 A. I don't. I spoke to P.G. often. I don't recall exact  
9 dates, but I would say certainly between April of -- or March  
10 of '18 and April of 2019.

11 Q. Do you recall any discussions you had with Sittenfeld  
12 about 435 after the property was transferred to the port?

13 A. I do. So after the property was purchased by the Port  
14 Authority, and I had -- I was no longer -- Chinedum was no  
15 longer a client, it was just the port, P.G. would call me. We  
16 talked often.

17 And there would be regular occasions where he would ask  
18 me, you know, what's going on with 435 Elm? Can you help get  
19 a meeting with this attorney or this person? And he was sort  
20 of generally checking in on it.

21 Every time we had those conversations, I -- my response  
22 was, you know, you need to stop asking me about this. You  
23 need to stop talking about this. I told you these guys are  
24 bad news.

25 Q. Did you have any conversations with Sittenfeld about

KINCAID - DIRECT

1 contributors hedging when considering contributions for  
2 Sittenfeld?

3 A. I did.

4 Q. What does "hedging" mean?

5 A. You know, in -- my understanding of it in the context of  
6 those conversations with P.G. was that he wanted them to be  
7 one hundred percent supportive of his campaign and not  
8 supporting anyone else, any potential challengers.

9 Q. Did you have any specific conversations that you can  
10 recall around the November 2017 period?

11 A. In November of 2017, late November 2017, this was after  
12 Mayor Cranley had been reelected, P.G. was gearing up for a  
13 mayoral run, we had breakfast.

14 And during the course of the conversation, he said to me  
15 regarding Chip Gerhardt, who is another lobbyist in town, I'm  
16 going to tell Chip that if he hedges on my campaign, I'm going  
17 to hedge on his clients as mayor.

18 Q. Did you have any discussions with Ndukwe about what  
19 Sittenfeld had told you about hedging on contributions?

20 A. Yeah. I believe I did. I don't recall the exact nature  
21 of that conversation.

22 Q. Do you recall a conversation that you had in  
23 September 2019 relating to hedging and conversations you had  
24 with Sittenfeld?

25 A. With Chinedum?

## KINCAID - DIRECT/CROSS

1 Q. Yes.

2 A. I mean, I generally think I did, but I don't recall the  
3 specifics.

4 Q. If I gave you a transcript of that communication, would  
5 it refresh your recollection?

6 A. Sure.

7 MR. SINGER: May I approach, Your Honor?

8 THE COURT: You may.

9 Q. So did that refresh your recollection as to whether you  
10 had a conversation with Ndukwe in --

11 A. Yeah.

12 Q. -- September of 2019?

13 A. Yes. We -- I mean, we were discussing P.G.'s asking  
14 Chinedum for contributions, not wanting Chin to give to  
15 Christopher Smitherman. And I said to Chinedum something  
16 along the lines of, you know, P.G. doesn't want anyone  
17 hedging.

18 MR. SINGER: No further questions, Your Honor.

19 THE COURT: Thank you.

20 CROSS-EXAMINATION

21 BY MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS:

22 Q. Mr. Kincaid, you and I have never talked at all about  
23 this case, correct?

24 A. Correct.

25 Q. I did try, do you know that?

1 A. Correct.

2 Q. You were around City Hall for a pretty long time, right?

3 A. So I served as chief of staff to Mayor Cranley for nearly  
4 three years.

5 Q. And before that, did I hear you say you were a fundraiser  
6 for Mr. Cranley as well?

7 A. Correct.

8 Q. What time frame was that?

9 A. So I -- going way back, I was a fundraiser campaign  
10 manager for John's council campaign -- well, congressional  
11 campaign in 2006, council campaign in 2007, and then a break.

12 In November of 2012, I started working as a campaign  
13 manager on his mayoral campaign, so November of 2012 until he  
14 took office in 2013. And then I served as chief of staff from  
15 December of '13 until, I think my last month was August of  
16 '16.

17 Q. And "chief of staff" means what?

18 A. Someone who is in charge of the mayor's office.

19 Q. In that role, you probably had the ability to understand  
20 people's reputations in City Hall, other elected officials?

21 A. Correct.

22 Q. P.G.'s reputation, he was pro-development of our downtown  
23 urban core?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. He had a reputation as being an aggressive fundraiser but

1 very ethical?

2 A. I'm sorry. I didn't hear. What was the last part?

3 Q. He had a reputation as being an aggressive fundraiser but  
4 very ethical, correct?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. He was always happy to engage people of all backgrounds  
7 and walks of life, and brag about Cincinnati and try to get  
8 investment dollars here in Cincinnati?

9 THE COURT: Hang on.

10 MR. SINGER: May we approach at sidebar, Your Honor?

11 THE COURT: You may

12 SIDEBAR CONFERENCE

13 MR. SINGER: Your Honor, we addressed in motions good  
14 acts evidence. It seems like the questions relate to good  
15 acts unrelated to the specific parameters that the Court has  
16 allowed for in their motion in limine order.

17 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: I don't know what good act  
18 I elicited.

19 THE COURT: I thought he was talking about the way in  
20 which Mr. Sittenfeld interfaced with constituents. Is that  
21 not what you understood he was asking about?

22 MR. SINGER: I understood he was asking to -- started  
23 talking about his reputation in the community, and then was  
24 transferring to move over to, I think, the areas of -- related  
25 to good acts.

1 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: That was not my intent.

2 MR. SINGER: Okay. Apologies.

3 SIDEBAR CONFERENCE CONCLUDED

4 THE COURT: Do you want to repose the same question,  
5 or we can read it back, either way.

6 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: Could you read it back. I  
7 just forgot what it was.

8 (The record was read by the court reporter.)

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. If I understood your testimony, and please correct me if  
11 I didn't, you stopped working for Mr. Ndukwe, I believe in  
12 April of 2019, right?

13 A. Yeah. I believe that's correct.

14 Q. And that's because the port indicated that they were  
15 likely to be the owners of at least the ground rights on  
16 435 Elm at some point in the immediate future?

17 A. Correct.

18 Q. And they ultimately did -- the property was transferred,  
19 as you know, to the port, I believe in June of 2019, right?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. You continued to have some communication, I believe, with  
22 the Port Authority and also Mr. Ndukwe during that time?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. The Port Authority has done deals for a dollar in the  
25 past on certain development projects, correct?



1 A. I believe so.

2 Q. 435 Elm was a complicated project, to say the least,  
3 right?

4 A. It was.

5 Q. Because of competing interests in the air rights and the  
6 ground rights, that's one of the reasons?

7 A. Yeah. I would say in my experience at City Hall, and  
8 during my time at City Hall and outside of City Hall, it was  
9 one of the more complicated ownership structures.

10 Q. When you were -- when you met with Rob and Brian, it was  
11 your belief that they were the financial backing behind  
12 Mr. Ndukwe, correct?

13 A. I was told that they were partners in the deal.

14 Q. And ultimately, as you continued to work through this  
15 project in 2019 with the Port Authority, obviously, they were  
16 actually not partners with Mr. Ndukwe, correct?

17 A. Who wasn't?

18 Q. Rob and Brian.

19 A. I think it's come out that they were not.

20 Q. Yeah. And Ms. Brunner's claimed reasons for why she did  
21 not enter into a partnership with Mr. Ndukwe were a few, and  
22 I'm asking if you're aware of those.

23 One was Mr. Ndukwe's, what she said was his lack of  
24 experience, correct?

25 THE COURT: Is there an objection?

## KINCAID - CROSS

1 MR. SINGER: Yeah. Objection. Laura Brunner's  
2 claimed reasons, there's no foundation that he would know what  
3 Laura Brunner's claims are.

4 THE COURT: Can you lay the foundation first?

5 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: Yes.

6 Q. Mr. Kincaid, I believe that you testified on direct that  
7 there were people in leadership positions in the city that  
8 were worried about -- I think your language was, on direct,  
9 and I think you used the words Chin wasn't able to pull it off  
10 or something. Do you remember that?

11 A. Yeah. I think I said that they had concerns about his  
12 ability to do the deal.

13 Q. And when you're talking about "they," are you talking  
14 about people like Laura Brunner at the port?

15 A. In that case, I was specifically talking about City of  
16 Cincinnati employees and elected officials.

17 Q. All right. In 2019, you continued to work with the Port  
18 Authority as a lobbyist, right?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. Did you become aware of Ms. Brunner's concerns at that  
21 time in 2019 about Mr. Ndukwe?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. And what were those concerns that she said?

24 A. I think, you know, it's obviously been a long time since  
25 I talked to her about this, but my recollection is that she

KINCAID - CROSS

1 had the same concerns about Chin's ability to pull off a deal.

2 Though having said that, she did -- she was willing to  
3 work with him. She asked him to come with a fully fleshed out  
4 plan, a reasonable -- a pro forma, and that they would  
5 seriously consider working with him.

6 Q. And were you involved at all with P.G.'s interactions  
7 with Mrs. Brunner or the port talking about why they should  
8 get this deal done for the city?

9 A. Involved like sitting in on the conversation?

10 Q. Yes.

11 A. No, not that I recall.

12 Q. Were you involved at all, or were you aware of a meeting  
13 that P.G. had in late -- in December of 2019 with a developer  
14 named Mike Schiff up in Columbus and Mr. Ndukwe at P.G.'s City  
15 Hall office about 435 Elm?

16 A. No.

17 Q. Do you still -- or, sorry. Up until 2021, did you work  
18 with the port as a lobbyist?

19 A. I worked for the port through 2021.

20 Q. Okay. When someone hires a lobbyist, the type of  
21 lobbyist that you are, it could be to help them with  
22 introductions and access to people like the mayor, correct?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Or council members?

25 A. Yes.

1 Q. And that happens in this city and all over the United  
2 States, correct?

3 A. I mean, my experience is here, but it seems like it does  
4 happen all over.

5 Q. Bundling and fundraising is a common practice in our  
6 privately-funded campaigns. Are you aware of that?

7 A. Yes. Yes.

8 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: I apologize, Your Honor.

9 THE COURT: You're good.

10 Q. Let me jump back a minute. On direct, when you said you  
11 told P.G. that you didn't like the way Rob and Brian were  
12 behaving, one is because he had voluntarily told you, he said,  
13 hey, these guys showed up with \$10,000 in cash, and he thought  
14 it was a little bit off, right?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And he disclosed that to you and said that's what  
17 happened, he didn't hide that?

18 A. Yeah. He was completely open about that.

19 Q. And there were also rumors swirling about a trip down to  
20 Miami, Florida with various people, Rob and Brian being on it,  
21 correct?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. But at the same time, when you told P.G. to stay away  
24 from them which, by the way, was sound advice as we sit here  
25 today, you also didn't think P.G. was doing anything wrong, it

## KINCAID - CROSS

1 was just Rob and Brian might have maybe some --

2 A. Yeah. Like I said on the direct examination, my advice  
3 to P.G. wasn't criminal advice, mine was political advice.

4 You know, I believed that P.G. was following the law when  
5 he was raising money. I believe that Rob and Brian were -- if  
6 they had not crossed the line, were so reckless that they were  
7 likely to cross the line. And because of the rumors at City  
8 Hall about the trips, and what I'd heard from Jared Kamrass  
9 and what P.G. had told me, I thought these guys are so  
10 reckless they're going to be caught. And when they're caught,  
11 you don't want to be the political candidate who took \$20,000  
12 or \$40,000 from them.

13 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: May I have one second, Your  
14 Honor?

15 THE COURT: You may.

16 Q. Mr. Kincaid, shortly after you had that conversation,  
17 which I believe was in March of 2019?

18 A. Which conversation?

19 Q. With P.G. saying, hey, you know, these guys were on a  
20 trip, and you had already told me that they had offered you  
21 \$10,000?

22 A. Yeah.

23 Q. You met with Rob and Brian thinking --

24 A. I --

25 Q. Sorry. Go ahead.

1 A. I met with them in April.

2 Q. So after you told P.G. to stay away from them, you did  
3 meet with them yourself?

4 A. I did.

5 Q. And in that meeting, you said that John Cranley -- that  
6 they can donate to John Cranley, correct?

7 A. I don't believe I said that. If I did, I don't recall  
8 saying that.

9 Q. Okay. It's not unusual for a candidate to want an  
10 individual to support only that candidate and not that  
11 candidate's opponent?

12 A. No, that's not unusual.

13 Q. What was -- in 2014, you mentioned a 2014 falling out  
14 that Mr. Ndukwe had with John Cranley. What was that?

15 A. So at some point, I don't recall when it happened,  
16 Chinedum tore down a building in Clifton without a permit, and  
17 was in -- was having problems at the city because of that.

18 And I believe it was potentially a criminal issue. He  
19 wanted the mayor to intercede on his behalf, and wanted me to  
20 intercede on his behalf, and my understanding was make the  
21 problem go away.

22 That didn't happen. He was fined \$25,000. And at some  
23 point after that came out, Chinedum called me on my City Hall  
24 landline and said, I don't feel like I'm getting a return on  
25 investment in my campaign contributions to the mayor. And if

1 that doesn't change, I'll have to reconsider my position in  
2 regards to giving in the future.

3 At that point, I said, Chinedum, I have to end this phone  
4 call right now. I hung up the phone.

5 As soon as I was able to get to the mayor, I don't know  
6 if he was in a meeting or not, but the first chance I had to  
7 speak with the mayor, I relayed this conversation to him.

8 And that was the point at which Mayor Cranley said, I'm  
9 done with Chinedum. We can't be interacting with someone who  
10 expects us to take campaign contributions in exchange for  
11 official work.

12 MR. C. MATTHEW RITTGERS: No further questions, Your  
13 Honor.

14 THE COURT: Thank you, Mr. Rittgers.

15 MR. SINGER: One second. No further questions, Your  
16 Honor.

17 THE COURT: Thank you. Sir, you may step down.

18 (Witness excused.)

19 (Excerpt of proceedings concluded at 3:42 p.m.)

20 \* \* \*

21

22 C E R T I F I C A T E

23 - - -

24 I, M. SUE LOPREATO, RMR, CRR, certify that the foregoing  
25 is a correct transcript from the record of proceedings in the  
above-entitled matter.

July 2, 2022

GOVERNMENT WITNESS

Direct by Mr. Singer..... Page 2  
Cross by Mr. C. Matthew Rittgers..... Page 13

— — —